Reviewer's report

Title: Stuttered swallowing: electric stimulation of the right insula interferes with water swallowing. A case report.

Version: 2 Date: 17 November 2010

Reviewer: Hagai Bergman

Reviewer's report:

In this case-report Soros et al provide new insight re the involvement of the insular cortex in the control of swallowing. They report on a 24-year-old man with medically intractable stereotyped nocturnal hyper-motor seizures due to a ganglioglioma. During invasive EEG monitoring they stimulate the right inferior posterior insular cortex with depth electrodes. The patient spontaneously reported a perception of a “stutter in swallowing”, and stimulation of this region at highest intensity was associated with irregular and delayed swallows. On the other hand, swallowing was not impaired during stimulation of the superior posterior insular cortex, regardless of stimulation intensity.

The authors conclude that the right inferior posterior insular cortex, but not superior posterior insular cortex, is involved in the neural circuitry underlying the control of swallowing. The report is well written, and provides a fair and comprehensive review of the literature. I am having only one minor comment that might improve the flow of this report.

Minor comment
Page 4-5: I am assuming the EEG survey was done before surgery and the removal of the ganglioglioma. It is not clear to me, why the authors give first the results of the surgery, and only then after the invasive physiology studies.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests