Reviewer's report

Title: Behavioral effects of congenital ventromedial prefrontal cortex malformation

Version: 3 Date: 18 July 2011

Reviewer: Michael Koenigs

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript presents a remarkable case report of an adolescent boy with a congenital lesion involving left vmPFC. The anatomical, behavior, and neuropsychological profile is quite striking and the data are presented very clearly. I believe this is a timely and important report, given the integral role of vmPFC in social/emotional behavior and the rarity of congenital vmPFC lesions.

I have only a couple suggestions

1. Minor essential revision:

The authors note that BW endorsed extremely high levels on depression and anxiety scales, but that this seemed incongruent with his outward mood and affect. Could the authors please explain this incongruency in more detail? In other words, did BW ever evince signs of depression/anxiety? Are there examples of times when he should have been sad or anxious, but was not? Is he inappropriately jocular or cheerful?

2. Discretionary revision:

With regard to explicit assessment of psychopathic traits in adolescents: Hare’s Psychopathy Checklist is the most widely used measure of psychopathy, and there is a “youth version” of this instrument (PCL-YV). The authors could potentially use this instrument to connect to a wider literature on psychopathic traits in adolescents (for example, PCL factor scores). They might be able to complete this measure based on the information they have. If not, the authors may wish to include this instrument in their test battery if they continue to study BW. (For the purposes of the present paper, I think the description/assessment of psychopathic traits is sufficient.)

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests