Reviewer's report

Title: Paraoxonase 1 (PON1) polymorphisms are not related with the risk for brain astrocytoma and meningioma.

Version: 1 Date: 9 February 2010

Reviewer: Luis Quiñones

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript “Paraoxonase 1 (PON1) polymorphisms are not related with the risk for brain astrocytoma and meningioma” is a well English written document and shows data enough to demonstrate absence of correlation between PON1 polymorphisms and brain astrocytoma and meningioma. The study is well supported with the bibliographic data enclosed and also is well supported by statistical analysis.

However I have some major and minor commentaries enclosed what must be overcome before acceptation.

Discretionary revisions

I think it would be better to increase the number of patients in order to improve the validity of the data, even though the statistical analysis shows an apparently enough powered size sample. Anyway the authors mention this aspect as a limitation of the study (discussion).

Minor essential revisions

The authors should improve English redaction of the abstract, particularly the second paragraph of the Background/objectives.

Major compulsory revisions

The statistical analysis of data is well performed, however, considering that the groups are non homogeneous in terms of gender and age, particularly patients in comparison with controls, this statistics should be performed with adjusted data (i.e. ORa = Odds Ratio adjusted by gender and age). This issue could be relevant and could change conclusions of the work.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests