Reviewer’s report

Title: Cerebral toxoplasmosis in Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS) patients also provides unifying pathophysiologic hypotheses for Holmes tremor.

Version: 1 Date: 7 March 2010

Reviewer: Karl Strecker

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory revisions:
The authors report nicely on a case of holmes tremor in an AIDS patient with toxoplasmic abcess involving thalamus and midbrain. The two additional videos show the symptoms and its disappearance. However, following the journals requirements for publishing '1. Unreported or unusual side effects or adverse interactions involving medications. The link between the intervention and the reaction should be based on as many as possible of the following:
- Time relation between intervention and reaction
- Dose response relation
- Withdrawal of treatment and re-challenge
- Supportive evidence from previous reports
- Biological rationale
2. Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease
3. New associations or variations in disease processes
4. Presentations, diagnoses and/or management of new and emerging diseases
5. An unexpected association between diseases or symptoms
6. An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient
7. Findings that shed new light on the possible pathogenesis of a disease or an adverse effect’
it seems to the reviewer that the authors missed to outline their unique new finding as they cite at least a few earlier reports that describe holmes tremor in AIDS patients with toxoplasmic abcess involving thalamus and midbrain before. Unfortunately the authors do not point out what part of their observations meets the above mentioned criteria. However, this is a well documented case report concerning a very rare disease.

Minor essential revisions:
The label of figure 1 is wrong: 'figure 2'

In the discussion the possibility of spontaneous relief in cases of holmes tremor should be mentioned as well as the possible effect of the antitoxoplasmic and prednisolone therapy on the tremor.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests