Reviewer's report

Title: A cross-sectional study of the nutritional status of community-dwelling people with idiopathic Parkinson's disease

Version: 1 Date: 15 November 2010

Reviewer: Ilana Schlesinger

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript A cross-sectional study of the nutritional status of community dwelling people with idiopathic Parkinson’s disease by A. Jaafar et al. addresses an important non-motor phenomenon in PD, under-nutrition. This is a community-based cross-sectional study done in the UK that assessed nutritional status and PD using standard measures.

A few comments:

Minor Essential Revisions

1. It is stated that "UPDRS score was recorded from patient responses to verbal questioning" though part III of the UPDRS requires neurological examination. What was actually done? Did examiners undergo training before performing this exam?

2. Due to the limited resources nutritional data were only collected from a sample of PD patients. It would be helpful to note how this sample was selected in order not to cause undue bias.

3. In the discussion it is stated that "UPDRS score and Hoehn and Yahr stage were significantly associated with under-nutrition in our cohort." To my understanding the data shown in Table 2 do not support this conclusion. Indeed no significant difference was found between PD patients with BMI below 20 with those with BMI above 20 in terms of their Hoehn & Yahr stage and UPDRS.

Discretionary Revisions

4. There was no association between BMI and UPDRS but there was an association between BMI and disease duration. Since UPDRS increases with disease duration this is an unexpected finding and the authors may want to comment on this.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'