Reviewer's report

Title: Pregabalin and gabapentin in partial epilepsy: a comparison of dose-response curves

Version: 1 Date: 16 September 2010

Reviewer: Gaetano Zaccara

Reviewer's report:

Pregabalin and gabapentin in partial epilepsy: a comparison of dose-response curves

The aim of the study was to compare the efficacy of two antiepileptic drugs which are very similar, namely gabapentin and pregabalin.

Four RCTs performed with gabapentin and four with pregabalin have been selected and only one marker of efficacy (responder rate) has been use in this meta-analysis.

Statistical analyses sound correct. In addition to base-case analysis, in which LOCF method has been used for the evaluation of patients included in RCTs, two sensitivity analyses on completer and responders, supported validity of findings, even though statistical significativity was lost.

The limit of this meta-analysis was that the comparison between these two drugs was indirect.

Discretionary revision: I think that it would be very interesting to analyse also tolerability data.

Why meta-analysis has not been done for those patients who withdrew from the study because of adverse effects?

Major Compulsory Revisions: In discussion I would explain the reason for which there is a lack of dose-effect relationship.

Furthermore, in table 1, I would report the length of studies (both titration and double-blind mainteinace) because this may have consequences on efficacy and tolerability

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I have received speaker’s or consultancy fees from EISAI, Jansen-Cilag, Novartis, Sanofi-Aventis, UCB Pharma.

The answers for the last fou question is: No