Reviewer's report

**Title:** Pregabalin and gabapentin in partial epilepsy: a comparison of dose-response curves

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 24 August 2010

**Reviewer:** cecilie johannessen landmark

**Reviewer's report:**

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined?
   Objective: To compare efficacy at approximately equivalent dose levels of pregabalin and gabapentin in patients with refractory partial epilepsy, based on findings in the literature. In the conclusion it is stated that pregabalin is likely to be more effective than gabapentin at approximately equivalent doses, but it should be stated more clearly that this is true at comparable effective doses.

2. Are the methods appropriate and well described? Yes

3. Are the data sound? The results are well presented in tables and figures and points to the conclusion in the article

4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? Yes

5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? Yes, and the list of references is appropriate and includes major studies that have been conducted

6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated? Limitations include that the results are based upon various clinical studies, and variability in design and performance will affect the calculations when comparing these studies

7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished? Yes

8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found? Title: Pregablin and gabapentin in partial epilepsy: a comparison of dose-response curves. Actually, dose-response relationships are studied rather than dose-response curves.

9. Is the writing acceptable? Yes

**Conclusion:** Minor essential revisions

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests