Reviewer's report

Title: Gender Differences in Traumatic Brain Injury: a Cohort Study

Version: 1 Date: 3 September 2010

Reviewer: Brian Zink

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. Since this is a secondary data analysis of a previous study group, it would be helpful for the authors to state what was the hypothesis of this study. Otherwise, it can be interpreted as just searching the previous data for additional "significant" findings.

2. On page 9 of the manuscript, 2nd paragraph, it is noted that high sex drive was reported in significantly more men (p<0.02), and the reader is referred to Table 2. However, in Table 2, under "High sex drive" has a p value reported of 0.11. The authors need to explain or correct this discrepancy.

Discretionary Revisions:

1. In order to determine if gender differences in symptoms are the same or different in people who have suffered TBI, a control group of non-injured patients could have been studied who were also administered the PCL. The authors should describe why this was not done.

2. In the Analyses section the authors describe that Bonferonni's adjustment for multiple comparisons was used in the group differences analyses, and that significance level was set at p<0.05. It is not clear from the text or in the tables, if the p values that are reported are Bonferonni adjusted or not. Certainly with the number of comparisons that were made there is a higher likelihood that a chance "significant" difference will be noted.

3. In the Discussion section, 1st paragraph, the final sentence seems to be a bit overstated. Since the differences reported between men and women who are post TBI are similar in many cases to the gender differences in non-injured people, it is hard to see how a knowledge of the differences will "provide essential information to health care providers and planners for the delivery of comprehensive care...".

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests