Reviewer's report

Title: Familial hypomagnesaemia with hypercalciuria and nephrocalcinosis (FHHNC): compound heterozygous mutation in the claudin 16 (CLDN16) gene.

Version: 3 Date: 6 March 2008

Reviewer: Nine Knoers

Reviewer's report:

This revised manuscript by Hampson et al. has been substantially adapted according to most of the points raised by this reviewer.

Clinical data on the affected sibling are present, the methods section has been extended, the explanation on the putative loss of function of the mutations has now been adequately addressed, discrepancies between text and legends are no longer present, and adaptations have been made in the text according to the minor points raised by this reviewer.

However, what remains in this manuscript is the fact that it contains hardly any news. In addition, the length of the discussion is still too long.

The spelling error FHNNC instead FHHNC is still present at several places in the manuscript.

What next?: Reject because too small an advance to publish

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests