Reviewer's report

Title: The effect of gender, age, and geographical location on the incidence and prevalence of renal replacement therapy in Wales

Version: 2 Date: 5 October 2006

Reviewer: Ken Farrington

Reviewer's report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Some discussion of the following points would be helpful

I am not sure that the authors explicitly state the rationale for undertaking the study in an era of full coverage of Wales by UK Renal Registry

Much of the background section is taken up discussing the benefits of age specific prevalence rates. There could have been more focus on gaps in epidemiological knowledge of RRT in UK and Wales in particular.

The main message of the paper is that there is significant unmet need for RRT in the very elderly. The authors do allude to the high comorbidity and dependency in this population but do not seem to be aware of conservative (non-dialytic) options for such patients and do not appear to consider that this amounts to treatment.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests