Reviewer’s report

Title: The effect of gender, age, and geographical location on the population prevalence of RRT provision in Wales

Version: 1 Date: 23 May 2006

Reviewer: Fabio Malberti

Reviewer’s report:

General
The study evaluated the effect of gender, age, and geographical location on the population prevalence of RRT provision in Wales. RRT age-specific prevalence and incidence rates peaked at around 70 years (1790 pmp) and 79 years (488 pmp), respectively. The treatment modalities had significantly different age-specific peak prevalence rates and distributions. These results are interesting.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Some aspects on the method used for the census of patients on RRT need to be clarified. It is not clear how the patients on RRT were identified and included, who were the physicians involved (renal physicians? general physicians?) and from which database the patients on RRT were extracted. How can the Authors be sure that all (100%) of the patients on RRT in Wales were included in the study? The very low acceptance rate reported in some areas (under 50 pmp) could be the result of an incomplete collection.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest