Reviewer's report

Title: Protective effect of EDTA preadministration on renal ischemia

Version: Date: 11 January 2006

Reviewer: Kanwaljit Chopra

Reviewer's report:

In this paper, Foglieni et al. had shown the Protective effect of EDTA administration on renal ischemia of rats. The data shows that EDTA stimulate eNOS production and protects the kidney from ischemic damage. The study seems to be well planned and conducted and the objectives seem to be clear. There are few minor revisions/changes which should be done in the MS before being finally accepted for publication

1. How the EDTA dose was selected?
2. If EDTA is soluble in Physiological saline, then what was the rational for i.v. administration of EDTA
3. If EDTA leads to increase in NO levels through increase in eNOS expression, then authors should have seen whether the eNOS inhibitors is able to block the protective effect of EDTA in I/R injury.
4. Some other abbreviation should be used for ischemia in place of simple ‘I’ (eg Isc) because it created confusion in following the meaning
5. In the creatinine graph the y scale is not correct instead of “commas” there should be “ots”
6. Page 25 last line: the statistical significance should be given properly “*”
7. Lots of typographical errors are there in the manuscript and an extensive language revision is necessary

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'