Reviewer's report

Title: Protective effect of EDTA preadministration on renal ischemia

Version: 1 Date: 27 December 2005

Reviewer: Yasuo Matsumura

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript clearly demonstrated that EDTA treatment efficiently improved the ischemia/reperfusion-renal injury, possibly through a stimulation of NO production. Purpose, method and observed findings are clear, but I had some concerns below.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major:
1. In figure 2, histochemical data demonstrated that EDTA-treatment protected the kidney from tissue injury such as tubular epithelial cell necrosis, dilation, protein casts and medullary congestion. These figures are only typical data. Did you have scoring results using all animals. If so, scoring results (in blind-manner) should be added.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor:
There are so many typographical errors.
ex: Abstract, line 4; kidney
Background, line 14; We asked if (delete us) line 18; systemically.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.