Reviewer’s report

Title: Ascites due to right atrial myxoma in a haemodialysis patient

Version: 1 Date: 9 October 2005

Reviewer: Kevin C Abbott

Reviewer’s report:

General
Several words are run-on and need to be divided, otherwise an interesting report of a rare complication

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
Several clinical questions should be answered: why was the Chest CT ordered after ascites was discovered? I would have expected an abdominal CT instead, unless both chest and abdomen were ordered together.
Prior to his presentation had he had any prior manifestations of heart failure?
The physical exam, but documenting normal lung sounds, indicates heart failure was primarily right-sided, not biventricular. Although the myxoma was in the right atrium, obstruction of the mitral valve, as attributed to the cause of death, would have been expected to result in substantial pulmonary edema (the authors should clarify whether this was inflow or outflow obstruction). Can the authors comment on this?
Since myxoma is so rare, under what circumstances would the authors recommend an ECHO?
Ascites is usually not due to heart failure.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
First page, dialyzed is misspelled. Many words are run-on

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'