Reviewer's report

Title: Does treating obesity stabilize chronic kidney disease?

Version: 2  Date: 31 March 2005

Reviewer: Frederic C Strife

Reviewer's report:

General Agnani and associates present a case report of a morbidly obese man with stage 4 chronic kidney disease who, after failed conservative treatment, underwent bariatric surgery. Weight loss was associated with clear improvement in diabetes and hypertension. In addition, 1/Cr stabilized and possibly improved. The authors present data from 1 year prior to surgery to 9 mos post surgery.

This case report is well written, focused and well illustrated. The report would be strengthened by adding data to the figure at least through the first quarter of 2005.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Minor Essential Revisions:

1. Table 1 is redundant as the information is shown in the figure.
2. It would appear that several of the references need completion.
3. Page 4, line 6: the word “the” is missing prior to the word “patient”.
4. Up-date the figure as suggested above.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.