Reviewer's report

Title: Does treating obesity stabilize chronic kidney disease?

Version: 2 Date: 13 March 2005

Reviewer: Arya M Sharma

Reviewer's report:

General

This is a well-written case-report of a morbidly obese patient with progressive loss of kidney function, whose clinical progression is halted (reversed) following weight loss with gastric bypass surgery.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The authors should be careful with their claim that this is the "first" case of renal failure being described in the context of weight loss surgery. They should discuss the work by Alexander JW, Transplantation 2004, who in fact present 30 patients with ESRD/Tx who undergo bariatric surgery.

The authors may also wish to address the issue of obesity-related glomerulopathy (work by Kambham and others) as being distinct from idiopathic FSGS with a rather benign prognosis.

The authors should note as a limitation of their study that a kidney biopsy was not performed and we therefore do not know the underlying diagnosis. Clearly, the effect of weight loss may vary in patients with different underlying renal disorders. Although unlikely in this case, the reduced need for medications following weight loss (e.g. ACEIs, NSAIDs, etc.) may also improve renal function. This should perhaps be discussed.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

The introduction and discussion appears somewhat lengthy for a simple "case report".

The table is redundant. The findings are obvious from the figure.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.