Author's response to reviews

Title: Antiglucocorticoid RU38486 reduces net protein catabolism in experimental acute renal failure

Authors:

Adrian Mondry (mondry@hotmail.com)

Version: 3 Date: 3 February 2005

Author's response to reviews: see over
Reviewer's report
Title: Antiglucocorticoid RU38486 reduces net protein catabolism in experimental acute renal failure
Version: 2 Date: 17 January 2005
Reviewer: Alan Bevington

Reviewer's report:
General
This modified manuscript has answered most of the points that I raised in my original review. For the sake of clarity however, I am asking for some Minor Essential Revisions.

Thank for the clarifications, which have been integrated into the revised manuscript.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
None

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
1) Abstract. In line 2 of the Methods section of the Abstract, the word "fasted" should be inserted before "bilaterally nephrectomised" and before "sham operated" to indicate the stress that the animals have received other than nephrectomy.

Text changed accordingly.

2) Abstract. At the end of the first sentence of the Conclusions section of the Abstract, ".......stress-stimulated elevated corticosterone secretion" please add "arising from surgery and fasting."

Text changed accordingly.

3) Conclusion (at the end of the Discussion). In line 5 please insert "fasting and" before "operative stress-induced cortisol action..."

Text changed accordingly.

4) Tables 4 and 5. The legends for these 2 tables seem to have been transposed. It would be simpler if these 2 tables were combined into one table with multiple clearly labelled columns of "P" values instead of giving the 2 sets of "P" values in separate, but otherwise identical, tables.

The two tables were combined into one.

5) Legend to Fig 1. The perfused muscle mass is said to be between the dotted lines. Should
The text was changed to: “… below the dotted line. The tail is clamped off.”

6) Legend to Fig 1. The wording for section B should be altered to "Recirculating perfusion system.
From the oxygenator (1), wherein the medium is gassed (95% O2, 5% CO2) it is pumped (3) up via a filter (nylon mesh,............"

Text changed accordingly.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
1) Leptin. In an isolated perfused hindlimb preparation, comprising mainly skeletal muscle, endogenous leptin secretion from adipocytes will probably be fairly small. I would therefore suggest that the reference to pH effects on leptin in this system (references 44 and 45) should be removed.

It is true that, during the perfusion phase, leptin has only little influence on this system. But in the two days leading up to the perfusion and analysis, the effects may be at work. In view of this, the reference was not removed.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests: I declare that I have no competing interests