Reviewer’s report

Title: Urinary Transforming Growth Factor-beta 1 (TGF-b1) as a marker of response to immunosuppressive treatment in patients with crescentic nephritis.

Version: 1 Date: 9 May 2005

Reviewer: M Nagata

Reviewer’s report:

This is interesting and has some new information, however there are some problems to be addressed.

Immunohistochemistry is insufficient quality and should be revised.

If expression pattern of TGF-beta is real like Fig 1A, urinary levels of TGF-beta should be influenced many factors.

The levels of TGF-beta at acute phase of crescentic GN may likely be produced by inflammatory cells, but not fibroblasts or crescent per se. Unreasonable discussion in the current version should be revised.

It is interesting to add the data with time course of urinary TGF-beta in some patients.

Also, urinary TGF-beta levels in other proliferative disease, including endocapillary proliferative GN should be provided.

Local TGF-beta expression in crescents were described in many papers but mainly they expressed fibrocellular stage.

How authors explain this?

It has bee known that local CTGF, working downstream of TGF-beta also involved in fibrosis/scar, which is very relevant for prognosis. Discussion may include some recent paper including,

Virchows Arch. 2004 Mar;444(3):257-63

Lab Invest. 2003 Nov;83(11):1615-25