Reviewer's report

Title: Experimental glomerulonephritis induced by hydrocarbon exposure. A systematic review

Version: 2 Date: 16 October 2005

Reviewer: Paul Cockwell

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

An estimate of the completeness of the search strategy used would be helpful, for example were all hydrocarbons with putative toxicity entered? Or only hydrocarbons with evidence supporting toxicity in man

Findings for individual hydrocarbons are duplicated in the text and table. This should be avoided

Why different disease patterns are seen in different animals exposed to the same toxin should be discussed in more detail.

A second table indicating the association of individual hydrocarbons with specific industry, the exposure of workers in that setting if known, and the amount of exposure compared to the animal experiments discussed here would be helpful.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

In the table it may be useful to note IM and EM in separate columns.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests