Reviewer's report

Title: The IgA nephropathy Biobank. An important starting point for the genetic dissection of a complex trait

Version: 1 Date: 13 September 2005

Reviewer: Ichiei Narita

Reviewer's report:

General
The author constructed a DNA bank of a large number of IgAN patients and their family. This DNA biobank and its database can be useful for the important and valuable starting point for the genetic dissection of a complex trait of this disease.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
1. The "healthy" volunteers and controls in a familial IgAN may not truly normal. A young adult without urinary abnormality may develop IgAN later, because the mean age of the onset of this disease is generally above 30 yo. Therefore, the age of the control should, at least, be above the mean age of the disease onset.

2. In this consortium, IgAN patients from three different populations in Italy, Greece, and Germany were recruited. It is generally well known that a possibility of stratification of the population studied should be considered. The author should include a discussion on this issue.

3. The authors should specify the racial profiles of each population, because ethnicity can have an influence on the magnitude of the impact of genetic backgrounds.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.