Reviewer's report

Title: State Level Variations in Nephrology Workforce and Timing and Incidence of Dialysis in the United States among Children and Adults: A Retrospective Cohort Study

Version: 1 Date: 4 December 2014

Reviewer: Cécile Couchoud

Reviewer's report:

The article of Ku and col. raises an interesting question concerning the effect of "supplier-induced demand" in the field of end-stage renal disease. However, we have some concerns concerning the methods used.

. The state level is too big to give an interesting answer. It would be very surprising to have in-state homogeneity for the 3 indictors: work force, timing and incidence.

. At a lower level, other methods of spatial analysis are recommended.

. By just indicating a correlation between work force and ESRD incidence without adjusting for other well-known factors associated with those indicators makes the interpretation of the results very difficult.

. Timing may be more related to patient's characteristics and medical practice than work force.

To our opinion, this study doesn't add any new knowledge.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests