Reviewer's report

Title: Serum under-O-glycosylated IgA level is not correlated with glomerular IgA deposition based upon heterogeneity in the composition of immune complexes in IgA nephropathy

Version: 2  Date: 4 April 2014

Reviewer: Hung-Chun Chen

Reviewer’s report:

In this study, Satake et al. investigated the correlation between Serum under-O-glycosylated IgA level and glomerular IgA deposition in IgA nephropathy patients. This study is well-designed and written. There were some comments for the author.

- Minor Essential Revisions

1. Error typing on table 1: Creatine -> Creatinine
2. Error typing on page 24 line 18: rGFR -> eGFR
3. According to the present study, Group C2 was quite different than other type of IgA nephropathy. High plgA trap value, low IgA and IgG deposition area, younger age, lower urinary protein excretion, less hematuria, higher eGFR, low histological grade were found. Does it mean better prognosis or better long term outcome? Is group C2 a different type of IgA nephropathy or early phase of other type of IgA nephropathy? May authors explain the interesting finding.
4. In the discussion, the author says “Patients in Group C2 were members of the age 15-24 peak and showed a mild form of IgA nephropathy.” What is the actually mean age and age distribution of C2 group in the study? (5 IgA patients was noted in the decision analysis flow chart)
5. Previous study demonstrated IgA/C3 ratio could predict IgA nephropathy prognosis. As for patients in group C2 in the present study, the serum IgA was high but low serum C3 level. Low histological grade was mentioned. Could authors explain the association and how to explain the data?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests’ below.