Reviewer’s report

Title: Changes in fibroblast growth factor 23 levels in normophosphatemic patients with chronic kidney disease stage 3 treated with lanthanum carbonate: results of the PREFECT study, a phase 2a, double blind, randomized, placebo-controlled trial

Version: 1 Date: 7 December 2013

Reviewer: Carmine Zoccali

Reviewer’s report:

This a small trial showing that lanthanum carbonate, notwithstanding a clearcut reduction urine phosphate (a sign of reduced intestinal absorption), does not lower FGF23.

The initial FGF23 fall is more apparent than real and it is just a post-hoc finding. I suggest the authors to better de-emphasise this observation.

It is possible that the phosphate binder being used be important. Indeed in a previous study by Yilmaz et al., (AJKD 59:177, 2012, which is not quoted in this paper) a 27% reduction in FGF23 was registered in a Group of 47 stage 4 CKD patients randomized to Sevelamer.

Previous papers should be all quoted and arranged in a clear table and findings in this study should framed in the context of available knowledge (previous clinical trials).

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'