Reviewer's report

Title: Agreement of reported vascular access on the Medical Evidence Report and on Medicare claims at hemodialysis initiation

Version: 1 Date: 12 January 2014

Reviewer: David Mendelssohn

Reviewer's report:

Review BMC

Agreement of reported VA on the Medical evidence Report and on Medicare claims at HD initiation. Solid et al. 2014

This is a very straightforward and rather mundane validation exercise. It would be of interest only in the USA. It shows that a new form gets concordant information as reported on medicare claims with respect to vascular access at HD initiation. This may be important for future admin database type research in the USA.

Major compulsory revision

The validation is between two documents. However, the real question is whether either of these instruments are concordant (reported VA), with the actual VA used at first dialysis in reality. This is not addressed and is a major limitation, and must be mentioned in the limitation section.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.