Reviewer’s report

Title: Can only histological evaluation determine the allocation of ECD kidneys?

Version: 1 Date: 27 October 2014

Reviewer: Giuseppe Lucarelli

Reviewer’s report:

Minor Essential Revisions:

Overall I like this paper. It discusses an important and controversial topic about the best selection criteria for ECD kidneys allocation. I suggest to include in the discussion the following recent studies that provide additional information on the role of biopsy-based selection and allocation of ECD kidneys:

1. Long-term results of biopsy-guided selection and allocation of kidneys from older donors in older recipients.

2. A single-center cohort study to define the role of pretransplant biopsy score in the long-term outcome of kidney transplantation.


4. The Kidney Donor Profile Index (KDPI) of Marginal Donors Allocated by Standardized Pretransplant Donor Biopsy Assessment: Distribution and Association With Graft Outcomes.
**Level of interest:** An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'