Reviewer's report

Title: The incremental treatment of ESRD: A low-protein diet combined with weekly hemodialysis may be beneficial for selected patients.

Version: 3 Date: 8 August 2014

Reviewer: Michel Aparicio

Reviewer's report:

To the authors:

In this interesting study, the authors have shown that during the first year of their maintenance HD therapy, patients receiving a treatment combining low-protein intake and once-weekly HD treatment presented better results, by the end of the first year, than patients receiving a conventional thrice-weekly HD treatment.

This is a well-written paper which contains a piece of important information both on economical and medical standpoint.

As it is mentioned in the title that this proposal concerns selected patients, the main concern of the study is the paucity of informations about the management of patients before the initiation of dialysis and the criteria of selection of patients:
- rate of progression of renal failure?
- frequency of follow-ups?
- compliance with medical (diet and drugs) prescription?
- what percentage these selected patients represent compared with the whole of ESRD patients followed during the same period?
- are diabetic patients systematically excluded?

Last point: survival rates at two years were high and similar in the two groups despite a striking difference in the evolution of residual kidney function contrasting with the observations made in other series (Kalantar-Zadeh Am J Kidney Dis 2014, Daugirdas Kidney Int 2013…), can you provide any comment on this result?