Reviewer’s report

Title: The financial impact of increasing home-based high dose haemodialysis and peritoneal dialysis

Version: 1 Date: 7 July 2014

Reviewer: Sandip Mitra

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

The abstract needs editing for the readership – clarity in summarising the results, and consistency such as in the use of prefix (variably used in the abstract and discussion)

Scenarios need to be well defined and described in a separate Table/chart

Table of scenarios/output for the current and and proposed tariff impact would be helpful

Transport and ESA cost not in the existing UK tariff, so its inclusion in the model is inaccurate and overestimates the model impact. This must be corrected.

Dialysis time and frequency bear a differential cost burden - not differentiated in the model.

Budget impact closely linked to PD but the proportional prevalence of each home modality split between PD and HHD not described, could be important for overall service design.

The article talks about a favorable tariff for cost of high dose dialysis, however the rate limiting factor is often patient choice or centre attitude (human factors). this is not discussed. The interaction of a therapy cost to other human factors need to be discussed.

Training cost has not been defined. this is an important aspect of HHD setup.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'