Reviewer's report

Title: The financial impact of increasing home-based high dose haemodialysis and peritoneal dialysis

Version: 1 Date: 2 June 2014

Reviewer: Jayne Smith-Palmer

Reviewer's report:

Discretionary Revisions

The authors use the reference Chertow et al. N Engl J Med. 2010 Dec 9;363(24):2287-300, as the reference to define ESRD as #90% loss of renal function. It would be better to define ESRD in terms of GFR as in commonly used guidelines, for example, KDIGO/ K/DOQI or the renal association (http://www.renal.org/whatwedo/InformationResources/CKDeGUIDE/CKDstages.aspx)

Minor Essential Revisions

There are some very small issues with grammar, particularly the use of "that" and "which"

- Major Compulsory Revisions

The authors have utilized a discount rate of 3.5% per annum for their budget impact analysis, whilst this may be in line with the UK discount rate, ISPOR guidance does not recommend discounting in budget impact analysis as this is not relevant for most budget holders. In view of this the authors should also present undiscounted results in the results tables.

The lower ESA cost is stated as being a key driver of savings in some scenarios, but there is minimal mention of this in the discussion section. It warrants more attention in the discussion section, with inclusion of clinical data, as without this the reader cannot establish if this is driven by lower rates of anemia, or if anemia is going undetected/untreated in patients undergoing home based dialysis.

The authors emphasize the benefits of home based dialysis but there is no mention of the limitations or the fact that some patients may prefer in center dialysis, this should be included in order to make the article more balanced.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.