Reviewer's report

Title: Treatment of patients with metastatic renal cell carcinoma undergoing hemodialysis: case report of two patients and short literature review

Version: 1 Date: 26 February 2013

Reviewer: Giuseppe Procopio

Reviewer's report:

This paper is well written and the Authors reported some suggestions regarding the treatment of bilateral kidney tumors.

Some points should be clarified

Major Compulsory Revisions:
1) Discussion; the key point should be the selection of patients potentially candidate to receive a benefit from the second nephrectomy. When physicians are not sure about the benefit of the second nephrectomy ,I think could be better to not remove the disease and preserve the QOL of the patients.In this setting the use of a TKI could improve the outcome of the disease without oblige the patients for hemodialysis.

The therapeutic approach for bilateral RCC should be discussed with the patients
2) Discussion; I disagree about the use of full dose of sunitinib in a patient receiving concomitant hemodialysis;initially a dose reduction of TKIs could be better to tes the tolerability of the drugs

Minor Essential Revisions
1)Background section the median OS in the era of targeted therapies for mRCC is more than 20 months ( please specify)
2)Background section; currently the standard therapy for mRCC, is based on TKI and m-TOR inhibitors.

Both subgroups of agents are eliminated by liver and only very partially by kidney.

This information should be emphasized.
3) The conclusion should be answer at the this question when bilateral nephrectomy and for which patients.Additionally the use of targeted therapies should be evaluated with warnings.
4) key words please add Tyrosin kinase inhibitors and targeted therapies

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

none