Reviewer's report

Title: Heme Iron Polypeptide For The Treatment Of Iron Deficiency Anemia In Non-Dialysis Chronic Kidney Disease Patients: A Randomized Controlled Trial

Version: 1 Date: 25 October 2012

Reviewer: Naro Ohashi

Reviewer's report:

Nagaraju et al reported that oral heme iron polypeptide (HIP) is similar in efficacy to intravenous (IV) iron sucrose in maintaining hemoglobin in non-dialysis (ND) chronic kidney disease (CKD) patients over 6 months without differences in adverse events.

Major comments

This manuscript may be important to compare the effectiveness to improve anemia and maintain hemoglobin levels between oral HIP and IV iron sucrose. However, some serious concerns are raised as follows:

(1) It is a small study to compare 18 patients in the oral HIP group to 22 patients in the IV iron sucrose group.

(2) The maximum follow up was 6 months and the period is too short to draw the conclusion.

(3) Clinical outcomes such as mortality, cardiovascular events, and quality of life were not estimated at all.

(4) HIP was not compared to another non-heme iron at all.

The authors showed these concerns in the limitation of their manuscripts. However, the authors should perform the larger and longer study to conclude these problems.

Minor comments

(1) The authors should show the p-values to compare the oral HIP group to the IV iron sucrose group in Table 1.

(2) Because some of the data were relatively close before and after iron treatment. For example, hemoglobin levels before and after HIP treatment were 110.5 (104-119) g/dL and 117 (110-128.8) g/dL, respectively. In the same way, hemoglobin levels before and after IV sucrose treatment were 108.5 (102-117) g/dL and 113 (107.5-120.3) g/dL, respectively. Therefore, the authors should show the significant differences before and after iron treatment.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.