Reviewer’s report

Title: The coincidence of IgA nephropathy and Fabry disease

Version: 1 Date: 15 October 2012

Reviewer: Isao Ohsawa

Reviewer’s report:

General comments:
This paper is very precious case report which refers to the coincidence of IgA nephropathy (IgAN) and Fabry disease (FD) in Caucasians. However, the conclusion will not be attractive and informative for nephrologist. It is properly important that electron microscopic findings and the genetic screening are very useful for diagnosis of FD. Then I have major comments for authors and request deeper discussion, which should be addressed first before this paper is acceptable for publication.

Major comments:
The discussion about interaction between the pathogenesis of IgAN and FD intrigues for nephrologists. As author discussed, if there is some association in autoimmune mechanisms of FD, the information about serum test of immune complex (IC) and histological deposits of IgG, IgM, C1q and C3 are needed, even in negative data. On the other hand, I would like to consider the clearance of glomerular depositions of IC which might be modulated by accumulated glycolipids because the paramesangial deposits which presented in Figure 2c did not show the typical form (Is there any distinct photos for Case 1 and 2?). You can extent the speculations for the pathogenesis of this two interesting cases.

Minor comments:
1. Case1: For demonstration of the coexistence of IgAN, some histological images are needed. I strongly recommended the photos which presented definitive findings for diagnosis of IgAN. Since this case behaved rapidly progressive clinical course, the information of the number and detail (cellular? fibrous?) of glomerular crescent is required.
2. Discussion: Misspelled in Line9, “crescenting glomerulonephritis” ---# crescentic glomerulonephritis

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.