Reviewer’s report

Title: The use of absolute values improves performance of estimation formulae: A retrospective cross-sectional study.

Version: 3 Date: 15 June 2013

Reviewer: Frank van der Sande

Reviewer’s report:

I read with great interest the article by Redal-Baigorri et al on how to optimize GFR measurements using a new formula.

The article is well written with a clear hypothesis. Statistically well performed.

The group studied had a nearly normal kidney function, and when I look at their BMI it was not that high (24.2 mean value) as well as the BSA. Since the authors propose to use a new formula not taking into account BSA it would be of interest for the reader to see and understand what will happen in really high overweight and underweight patients. Could the authors respond to this?

Also, the effect of measuring GFR with advanced disturbances in kidney function with this new formula could be of utmost importance in daily clinical practice. Could the authors respond to this, and did they already use the newly proposed formula in this group of patients (CKD IV and V).

Finally, it was a retrospective analysis, do the authors already performed a prospective study with this new formula and if so could they show some data, did might be of interest for the readers.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest.