Reviewer’s report

Title: Renal dysfunction, restrictive left ventricular filling pattern and mortality risk in patients admitted with heart failure: A 7-year follow-up study

Version: 2 Date: 9 February 2013

Reviewer: Gillian Whalley

Reviewer’s report:

This is a sub-analysis of the larger ECHOES trial and provided interesting data about the interaction of severe diastolic dysfunction and renal failure in heart failure. It is a well-conducted study and well presented manuscript.

Minor Essential revisions:

In the first line of the discussion, the authors state: “These data are, according to our knowledge, the first to show that eGFR is associated with mortality risk independently of RF in HF patients”

In fact, that is not the case. The independence of the contribution of RFP and eGFR to mortality has been reported previously (see Bruch JASE 2007;20:989-997). This study reported that across all mitral filling patterns prognosis was worse with renal failure. The current study extends this work by looking at bands of eGFR, rather than categories of MFP which the Bruch study did. Please include this study in your discussion and comment on the similarities and differences between these two studies.

Discretionary revisions:

This is interesting data that supports eGFR as an important prognostic indicator independent of LVEF and diastolic function. As the authors state, the exact cause of this remains unproven. This may be related to underlying hypertension and LV hypertrophy. Is it possible to separate the group on this basis? Perhaps look at ischemic versus non-ischemic heart failure patients, or HF-PEF versus HF-lowEF?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests