Reviewer’s report

Title: Estimation of Glomerular Filtration Rate from Serum Creatinine and Cystatin C in Octogenarians and Nonagenarians

Version: 1 Date: 29 July 2013

Reviewer: Radovan Hojs

Reviewer’s report:

The study by Lopes et al. Estimation of glomerular filtration….. is interesting and important because included population is very old. Nowadays the number of very old patients is increasing worldwide and also the prevalence of CKD in these patients is high. There are very few studies comparing different equations to estimate GFR in very old.

Major comments:

1) There is already the study (Bevc et al. Ther Apher Dial 2011; 15:261-8) comparing different equations (MDRD, CKD-EPI creatinine, CKD-EPI creatinine-cystatin C and simple cystatin C equation) in elderly (over 65). It is true that the population in the study by Bevc is not so old but should at least be mention in discussion. Very interesting in study by Bevc et al. is the usage of simple cystatin C equation which is usable in everyday clinical practice without complex calculation. It will be interesting if authors include this equation in their work and check its usefulness in the really old population (as is in study by Lopes et al.).

2) Authors are using »…tendency towards… p.9« , »…reclassification was favorable, albeit not statistically significant…« p.10, »…tended to improve classification…« - it should be clearly stated if the difference is statistically significant or not (p < 0.05; if not: »the trend« can also be coincidence.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.