Reviewer's report

Title: Estimation of Glomerular Filtration Rate from Serum Creatinine and Cystatin C in Octogenarians and Nonagenarians

Version: 1 Date: 22 July 2013

Reviewer: Anders Larsson

Reviewer's report:

Regarding the manuscript.

The authors have addressed an important topic: how to correctly estimate GFR in elderly persons. I only disagree (partly) with one of the authors statement that they had a "relatively small sample". In my opinion it is quite admirable to measure GFR in almost 100 individuals. It must have taken a great effort to collect so many elderly persons. (The authors do not have to make any changes due to this remark.) I also like the exclusion criteria used. They have in my opinion focused on the important patient groups to exclude but kept as many of the other patients as possible.

I have no major revisions.

Minor essential revisions

Both creatinine and cystatin C methods have changed over time, thus the time of assay is of importance. The elderly were identified 2010-2011, however there may be a time span between identification and testing??? I would appreciate if the authors also added approximately when the creatinine and cystatin C assays were performed.

Under the result section, second paragraph please add mean and SD after 55.9 ... so that the readers do not have to go back to the materials section.

Discretionary revisions

Under background, line 1-2 the authors say: that the prevalence is rising, particularly in the elderly. I agree that the prevalence is rising but I believe that it is mainly due to the fact that life expectancy is increasing. We are getting a more elderly population and thus more patients with CKD. I interpret the sentence as the authors means that the prevalence e.g. per 1000 elderly also is increasing. If I would be the authors I would add a few words saying that this is mainly due to increased life expectancy.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.