Reviewer's report

Title: Cross sectional associations of epicardial fat with coronary calcification, insulin resistance, markers of inflammation and fibroblast growth factor-23 and in stage 3-5 chronic kidney disease patients

Version: 2 Date: 13 August 2012

Reviewer: Kultigin Turkmen

Reviewer's report:

Comments to the Author

This report found significant relationships between epicardial fat tissue, chronic inflammation and coronary artery calcification in 94 CKD patients. The aim and hypothesis were clearly stated. The methods of study, including the statistical analysis, were appropriate for this study, although a longitudinal design with repeated measurements would yield more information. In summary, this paper deals with an interesting and clinically important question. However, I have some major and minor comments on manuscript to improve presentation.

Major Comments:
1) In results section, the data about fetuin_A, IL-6 and OPG should be written in the text.
2) In the discussion you can summarize the main results in the first paragraph.
3) I do not understand why you performed multivariable regression analysis in patients who were not using insulin? If the reason is appropriate you have to discuss this in the discussion section.
4) You mentioned the relation between inflammatory markers and EFT. Please discuss this issue more.

Minor Comments:
1) Please correct the spelling errors in the introduction part.
2) Correct the reference 13 as Tonbul HZ, Turkmen K, Kayikcioglu H……..
3) You used HOMA-IR formula to define IR. However, this formula is not the best tool to define IR. Please mention this as a limitation.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.