Reviewer’s report

Title: Triggering of suicidal erythrocyte death by uremic toxin indoxyl sulfate

Version: 1 Date: 14 June 2013

Reviewer: Guy Neild

Reviewer’s report:

Triggering of suicidal erythrocyte death by uremic toxin indoxyl sulphate

Dr Lang and his group have already published a very great deal on this subject. There are hundreds of uraemic toxins and there is nothing to stop them examining ‘eryptosis’ by one toxin after another.

Is this mechanism relevant to man; relevant to the clinic situation? I don’t know and I can find no relevant discussion of this in the paper.

This is a research paper and not a review article and it is absurd to have 94 references. Any resubmission should have no more than 30 references.

We need some practical information and discussion of how this process can be measured in man; or if it has been what has been shown. Ultimately (not necessarily in this paper) they have to show that some clinical measurement of eryptosis correlates with the blood concentration of indoxyl sulphate (or whatever toxin they are measuring).

BMC is a nephrology journal and this paper needs to address the problem in a clinically relevant manner. At present this is an excellent biochemistry paper that needs to be published in a suitable biochemistry journal.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'