Reviewer's report

Title: TNF-alpha blockade is ineffective in animal models of established polycystic kidney disease

Version: 3 Date: 27 August 2013

Reviewer: Harold Aukema

Reviewer's report:

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined?
   yes

2. Are the methods appropriate and well described?
The methods should be clarified in several places (minor essential revisons):
   - use pck nomenclature consistently
   - describe the histological procedures so the study can be replicated
   - clarify the interventions in each model in the methods – when given, how long, how old were the animals, dosages used, how many times per day were they dosed?

3. Are the data sound?
   yes

4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition?
   yes

5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data?
   yes
   - page 7, last line of first paragraph – clarify what is meant by the term “this efficacy model”

6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated?
   yes

7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished?
   yes, but a few things should be clarified
   - describe the PKD diseases more completely. The second sentence is rather vague and does not mention PKD1, the most common form of PKD. In several places (here and in the discussion), “polycystic disease” is used. If PKD is meant, this should be used.
8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found?
   - some specifics should be included that are not present, including the dose and length of administration of the drugs, the names of the animal models used, and the mozavaptan results. Also, why is mozavaptan not in the title?

9. Is the writing acceptable?
   yes
   - typo on page 5, line 4, “rates” should be “rats”

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests' below