Reviewer's report

**Title:** Validation of the new Classification of Pauci-Immune Glomerulonephritis in a United States cohort and its Correlation with Renal Outcome

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 26 July 2013

**Reviewer:** Guy Neild

**Reviewer's report:**

Validation of the new Classification of Pauci-Immune Glomerulonephritis in a United States cohort and its Correlation with Renal Outcome.

This is a single centre audit of the outcome of their patients with pauci-immune glomerulonephritis (1995-2011) according to the recent Histopathologic Classification of ANCA-Associated Glomerulonephritis (JASN 2010).

I found the paper very difficult to understand until I had read the primary paper carefully (Histopathologic Classification of ANCA-Associated Glomerulonephritis).

The problems with this paper are:

1. 18% of patients were ANCA negative compared with 2% in the original paper (although the sums do not quite add up in the original).
2. The ratio of the different categories was quite different in this paper with fewer 'crescentic'
3. The paper is padded out with detailed information on therapy given to the different groups.
4. The follow up is 1 year versus 5 in the JASN paper.

All that is required with this study is to reproduce the renal survival figure (figure 4 in the JASN paper). In the JASN paper it can be seen at a glance that when the patients are stratified according to the 4 groups they separate out clearly.

It has been known for at least 30 years that if you want to predict the long-term GFR from a biopsy you evaluate the tubulo-interstitial damage. The authors of the JASN paper acknowledge this but do not produce any data (although they have subsequently published a separate paper addressing this (Tubular Lesions Predict Renal Outcome in Antineutrophil Cytoplasmic Antibody—Associated Glomerulonephritis after Rituximab Therapy).

The authors could resubmit a paper that had some genuine novelty and interest if they

1) omitted all the irrelevant therapy information and analysed the tubulo-interstitial damage, and
2) Comparing it with the glomerular analysis and with outcome.

Major Compulsory:
to reproduce the renal survival figure (figure 4 in the JASN paper).

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
'I declare that I have no competing interests'