Reviewer’s report

Title: Clinical features and survival of a large cohort of ADPKD patients receiving renal replacement therapy

Version: 1 Date: 5 July 2013

Reviewer: Giuseppe Conte

Reviewer’s report:

This paper examines the epidemiological changes in ADPKD versus non-ADPKD cohorts receiving RRT during the last 25 years, using data from Catalan Registry. The main findings indicate that the age at initiation of RRT remained stable over the three periods in the ADPKD group whereas it increased significantly in the non-ADPKD and the ratio of males/females was higher for non-ADPKD than for ADPKD patients. Moreover, the prevalence of diabetes was significantly lower in the ADPKD group, as were most of the co-morbidities studied, with the exception of hypertension. As remembered by the Authors, there is not any other similar study comparing the age at onset of ESRD between patients with and without ADPKD over time. The main results of this paper are clinically important because they strongly suggest the prevalent impact of unmodifiable genetic factors in the absence of a specific treatment. However, the renal progression of ADPKD can be delayed with newer therapeutic approaches which are currently being tested, as mentioned by the Authors.

Minor essential revisions:

1) The title can be modified in “ADPKD patients receiving renal replacement therapy: a 25-year survey from Catalan Registry”.

2) The Authors report in the methods the intention to analyze “the time elapsed since start of dialysis to transplant surgery, and the age at the time of transplantation” in the two cohorts (ADPKD vs non-ADPKD) but they do not show any data

3) In the Table 3, the Authors indicate “social” as cause of death. They might explain in the text what means it.

4) The reference 16 is incomplete, lacking the volume and the pages of the article.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.