Reviewer's report

**Title:** Clinical features and survival of a large cohort of ADPKD patients receiving renal replacement therapy

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 20 June 2013

**Reviewer:** Arlene Chapman

**Reviewer's report:**

Authors Torra et al take advantage of a rich data set from the Catalan renal registry which follows patients at the point of initiation of dialysis. This registry now provides over 20 years of longitudinal data to determine age of onset of ESRD, comorbidities, causes of death, rates of peritoneal, hemodialysis and transplant rates. The authors use this data registry to better understand the trend in age of onset of ESRD in ADPKD individuals. The authors find 1) no increase in age of onset 2) a reduced but still present disparity between men and women, 3) higher than other renal diseases with regard to survival, graft survival and survival on dialysis.

This is an important paper and should be published to the renal readership. However, there are questions that should be addressed and presentation of data that should also be modified before the paper can be considered acceptable.

**Minor Essential Revisions**

1) The authors should explain the limitations of the data only starting at the time of onset of ESRD. Also, whether the patient population is transient or not should also be addressed.

2) The lower than expected preemptive transplant rate in a hereditary disorder should also be explained (are living related donors less common because of the familial nature of ADPKD?

3) The extremely low rate of hypertension compared to other cohorts deserves comment. Is the diet perhaps different in this region?

4) African American race has not yet been associated with a poorer renal outcome, only in those with sickle cell disease as well. This should be modified.

5) The authors are encouraged to provide Kaplan Meier plots for patient survival and graft survival at three years.

6) Can the authors provide insight into the time of first interaction with a medical specialist when they are diagnosed with ADPKD? Is this close to the time of RRT or years before. Perhaps this accounts for the lack of improvement in age of onset of ESRD.
**Level of interest:** An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.