Reviewer’s report

**Title:** Retained Organic Solutes, Patient Characteristics and All-Cause and Cardiovascular Mortality In Hemodialysis: Results from the Retained Organic Solutes and Clinical Outcomes (ROSCO) Investigators

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 3 May 2013

**Reviewer:** Luc Frimat

**Reviewer’s report:**

The manuscript BMC-2013 by Melamed ML et al. “Retained Organic Solutes, Patient Characteristics and All-Cause and Cardiovascular Mortality In Hemodialysis: Results from the Retained Organic Solutes and Clinical Outcomes (ROSCO) Investigators”. deserves to be published.

Authors’ epidemiological expertise is assured. Rationale of the study is well explained. Study design is irreproachable, i.e. prospective cohort study of incident ESRD patients with strict definitions of variables and low rate of lost to follow-up. Analyses depict in-depth all assumptions. Statistical assumptions are precisely checked. Discussion is well balanced. Limitations are clearly set out. Conclusions issued from this study are valid.

One could observe that patients inclusion in CHOICE study date now for more than 10 years. So the conclusion of the study could be somewhat outdated in 2013.

Discretionary revisions:

1. The fact that this is the first study in the US about this field might suggest different pathogenesis, dialysis regimens, medications use... than in Europe or elsewhere.


3. The conclusion paragraph of the abstract looks too long and redundant with the results paragraph.

4. Relevant references:

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'