Reviewer's report

Title: Age as an effect modifier for renal transplantation in Canada's Aboriginal Peoples

Version: 2 Date: 31 July 2012

Reviewer: Rachel Johnson

Reviewer's report:

This study based on a cohort of over 30,000 patients starting dialysis over a ten year period demonstrates less good access to renal transplantation for Aboriginal people in Canada, particularly for the younger age groups. The methods applied take account of the competing risks of death and transplant for the outcome of patients starting dialysis and the results are clearly presented in the Tables and Figures.

I have a number of comments to be considered as discretionary revisions:

1 It may be helpful to refer to ‘access to renal transplantation’ in the title and abstract as it is only upon reading the results section of the abstract that it becomes clear that the analysis is of time from start of dialysis to transplant (rather than outcome after transplantation).

2 It would be interesting to know the median follow-up period in the Aboriginal and Caucasian groups. Are there any differences in rates of loss to follow-up? How are deaths notified and are the notifications complete?

3 It is not clear if poorer rates of transplantation are associated with lower rates of listing for transplant, or less access to transplant once listed, or both. Do the authors have any information on this? What is the allocation policy for deceased donors and might it lead to inequity, through HLA matching between donor and recipient, for example?

4 Figures 2-4: it would be helpful to have consistency in colour coding across these figures (Fig 2 differs from 3 and 4 currently).

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests