Reviewer's report

Title: Seroprevalence of Streptococcal Inhibitor of Complement (SIC) suggests association of streptococcal infection with chronic kidney disease.

Version: 2 Date: 23 January 2013

Reviewer: Jonathan M Chemouny

Reviewer's report:

In this study, Karmarkar et al. confirmed the higher seroprevalence of anti-group A streptococcus in CKD and ESRD patients than in healthy controls in an new population. More interestingly they suggest a link between seropositivity and renal prognosis. However, the manuscript does not meet editorial criteria in its current form.

Major compulsory revisions:

1) Definition of GAS seropositivity is somewhat confusing as the healthy population is defined as individuals indemn of CKD rather than patients who did not experience GAS infections. This definition prevent the comparison to study 15 where the positivity is defined as +2sd fom the mean of results of an unexposed population.

2) Effects of age, sex and comorbidities on SIC or DRS seropositivity seem to have been exclusively studied in CKD and ESRD patients and not in healthy controls.

3) Demographic data need to be compared. Age and sexe ratio seem to be different between patients and control. If true, these differences may have an impact on the different higher rate of SIC or DRS seropositivity between age and sex and the adequate statistical analysis should then be performed.

Minor essential revisions

4) The manuscript is overall well written but some misspellings and errors mays still be found throughout the text and should be corrected

5) The authors conclude "that past streptococcal infection is an independent risk factor for CKD" whereas the study is retrospective and can not demonstrate a causal relationship.

Discretionary revisions

6) Demographic data may be presented as a table

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests