Reviewer's report

Title: The fate of bone marrow-derived cells carrying a polycystic kidney disease mutation in the genetically normal kidney

Version: 4 Date: 17 July 2012

Reviewer: Anna Paola Paola Mitterhofer

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions related to previous reviews

Principal considerations

1.,6.
In the reviewed-manuscript the aim of the study has not been clarified as requested: Authors describe the experiment in background and objectives are not clearly expressed.
Authors have not strengthened the background as requested and they have not included in the text their comments from cover letter as requested.
Authors have not explained reasons of the study based on data already known in literature and their conclusions don’t add new information.
As already stated most conclusions are foregone Authors discuss data already known in Literature.

7. Limitations of the study have not been well described as requested.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No, I don't.