Reviewer's report

Title: Long-term renal outcome in patients with malignant hypertension: a retrospective cohort study

Version: 1 Date: 2 December 2011

Reviewer: Eduard Shantsila

Reviewer's report:

Amraoui and colleagues report important results on the renal outcomes in patients with malignant hypertension, a relatively rare but clinically challenging disorder. The work has been performed by a reputable group in the field of malignant hypertension.

Comments:

‘The proportion of patients developing ESRD was not significantly different between those having primary malignant hypertension and those with primary renal or renovascular disease (24% vs. 38% respectively, P = 0.18).’ The study power does not seem to be sufficiently powered for such comparison and the trend is (as perhaps expected) towards the higher rates in those with secondary MHT.

Follow-up BP was adequately controlled in only 31% of participants, a rather low value. It could be related to suboptimal compliance, particularly among the ethnic minorities, which were not minorities in this study. Obviously, it would be improbable impossible to assess the compliance retrospectively, but this should be discussed more thoroughly.

The authors decided to exclude ‘referred patients with malignant hypertension as they could be more likely to have or develop ESRD’. Although the argument is reasonable, a proportion of more severe patients was excluded, which could affect the natural pattern renal impairment in the whole MHT population.

Please specify which echocardiographic criteria of left ventricular hypertrophy were used.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests