Reviewer's report

Title: Unexpected outcome after sclerotherapy of simple renal cyst

Version: 2 Date: 18 May 2012

Reviewer: Mayank Agarwal

Reviewer's report:

In this single case report the authors found development of papillary RCC in sclerotherapy-treated simple large renal cyst.

This report is important for making clinicians aware of the ‘malignant potential’ of Bosniak-I cysts and therefore potential need for a regular follow up. However, this report consists of repetition of description of case report over and over again without any discussion.

Background – verbatim repetition in abstract and full text

Material – post-alcohol sclerotherapy follow up imaging is not provided. This is important since the cyst had regrown initially.

Discussion – is practically non-existent. Ist para talks about definition of B-I cyst and II-para about that there is no case report tumor after sclerotherapy. It is of paramount importance to discuss other case reports / series – any common factor in those reports (e.g. - ... all cysts had been ‘large’). Since these findings contradict the standard of ‘no follow up’, the authors must give some justification in favour of follow up. Could sclerotherapy be an inciting factor in tumorigenesis?

English language needs correction by a person with knowledge of English grammar and syntax.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests