Reviewer's report

**Title:** Identification of Nephropathy Candidate Genes by Comparing Sclerosis-Prone and Sclerosis-Resistant Mouse Strain Kidney Transcriptomes

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 20 February 2012

**Reviewer:** Mukut Sharma

**Reviewer's report:**

The manuscript “Identification of nephropathy candidate genes by comparing sclerosis-prone and sclerosis resistant mouse strain kidney transcriptomes” by Dr. El-Meanawy et al describes results obtained by using SAGE to identify genes that confer susceptibility or resistance to FSGS.

The manuscript addresses an important clinical problem and the animal models described herein are well established and familiar to investigators.

Authors compared transcriptomes in sclerosis-prone ROP-Os/+, sclerosis-resistant C57-Os/+ and used a human FSGS biopsy material for determining agreement between their findings in mice and human disease. Genes that showed different expression included Nrp2, Gstt and Itch. Signaling pathway network analysis showed that TGF-b1 signaling is affected despite comparable expression of TGF-b1.

**Major Compulsory Revisions**

The manuscript requires a thorough revision to correct numerous errors in the text. Table/Figure numbers, consistency between the numbers in the text and in Tables.

Most important, authors need to include Table 6 referred to on Page 11. This raises the query if there is a Table 5.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.