Reviewer's report

Title: Mycophenolate and FK506 Have Different Effects on Kidney Allograft Fibrosis in Rats that Underwent Chronic Allograft Nephropathy

Version: 2 Date: 30 April 2012

Reviewer: Sander van Leuven

Reviewer's report:

Dr Lei Luo and colleagues have performed an interesting study in which they evaluated the effects of FK506 and MMF on renal fibrosis in the kidney in rats that underwent allograft nephropathy. The study was well-designed and the manuscript is well-written. Several minor essential revisions will need to be addressed.

Please write out in full mycophenolate mofetil in the title.

Similarly, please clarify abbreviations in the abstract, e.g. CTGF, #-SMA, PAS, HE, PAS

In the introduction, the authors state: “In our previous study, we observed that FK506 up-regulated the expression of TGF-#1 and Smad2 in grafts, and down-regulated the expression of Smad7, while MMF had opposite effects.”. Please add a reference.

According to the BMC Nephrology website a Background section should be followed by a Methods section. The numbers of the sections appear to be incorrect as section 5. Materials and Methods starts with subsection 2.1 Animals.

Each treatment group consisted of 9 rats. The rats were sacrificed to harvest the renal allografts at 4, 8 and 12 weeks post-transplantation. Does that mean each time point consisted of only 3 rats? Please clarify.

Discussion, page 9, ..........CAN and EMT, however, with no statistical significant difference.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests