Reviewer's report

Title: Mycophenolate and FK506 Have Different Effects on Kidney Allograft Fibrosis in Rats that Underwent Chronic Allograft Nephropathy

Version: 2 Date: 19 April 2012

Reviewer: Ender Hur

Reviewer's report:

The study “Mycophenolate and FK506 Have Different Effects on Kidney Allograft Fibrosis in Rats that Underwent Chronic Allograft Nephropathy” conducted by Luo et al.

This paper uses a well accepted rat model of transplantation.

Abstract: “CTGF, #-SMA, PAS and E-cadherin expressions were determined and HE and PAS stains were performed…..”

Abbreviations (CTGF, #-SMA, HE, PAS) should be defined

Introduction: “A number of short- and long-term animal and human studies on kidney allografts have demonstrated the nephrotoxicity of tacrolimus.[1,2] Reduced dosing or withdrawal of tacrolimus, or addition of mycophenolate mofetil (MMF) in patients generally results in less progression in chronic allograft nephropathy (CAN) indices.[3] MMF is the most commonly used drug for maintenance in transplant patients. By decreasing the intensity of rejection, MMF may prevent subsequent fibrosis and development of CAN.[4] In our previous study, we observed that FK506 up-regulated the expression of TGF-#1 and Smad2 in grafts, and down-regulated the expression of Smad7, while MMF had opposite effects. Moreover, it has been reported that MMF can ameliorate transplant fibrosis in an experimental animal CAN model.[5,6]”

Mechanism of action of MMF and FK506 must be clearly defined.

Material and Methods: The study design is reasonable; however there might be a MMF+FK506 group in order to clarify the combined effect. (It’s recommended to write it in limitation of this study.)

In page 13 the sentences starting “Chronic histological changes were graded………” needs some detailed information about histological changes.

Figure Legends sections: Abbreviations should be defined.

The spelling and grammar throughout the entire manuscript needs some attention.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests